



## Scandic Journal of Advanced Research and Reviews

ISSN: 2703-965X    CODEN (USA): SJARCA  
Cross Ref DOI: [dx.doi.org/10.55966/sjarr](https://doi.org/10.55966/sjarr)  
Journal homepage: [www.sjarr.com](http://www.sjarr.com)

### Indian Hybrid Warfare since 2008: Impacts on Pakistan Security

Nouman Ahmad<sup>1</sup>, Abdul Haseeb<sup>2</sup> & Asma<sup>3</sup>

- 1, M.Phil. Scholar, Department of Political Science, International Islamic University Islamabad.  
Email: [Nouman.msps91@iiu.edu.pk](mailto:Nouman.msps91@iiu.edu.pk)
- 2, M.Phil. Scholar, Department of Political Science, International Islamic University Islamabad.
- 3, M.Phil. Scholar, Department of Political Science, International Islamic University Islamabad.

Scandic Journal of Advanced Research and Reviews, 2022, 3(02), 040–073

Article DOI: <https://doi.org/10.55966/sjarr.2022.3.2.0052>

---

#### Abstract

The study aims to highlight the Indian Hybrid Warfare, post 2008 Mumbai attack and its likely impact on Pakistan Security. The study succeeds in the Exploratory, Descriptive, and Predictive data analysis approaches. Both primary and secondary data was used to elaborate different aspects of the entire study. This study conducted Structured Interviews of Pakistani, Indian and Western retired military officers, diplomats, academicians with expertise in strategic studies.

Hybrid warfare is not a new thing but it comes from centuries like a strategy and comes out with different perspectives. We know that India Pakistan is involve in this hybrid strategy from centuries against one another. Since 1947 till now we can do Covert operations against one another. So, it is not a new concept in our context but in 2008 when Mumbai attack happened against India. So, from post 2008 the change which occurred in Indian hybrid strategy was phenomenal because before this such changes never happened which Impact on Pakistan Security.

However, the risk of limited war under the nuclear umbrella cannot be ruled out. Pakistan needs to improve its conventional deterrence to make it costly any misadventure by India. The prospects of direct military confrontation between India and Pakistan would decrease with an effective conventional answer by Pakistan. The study argues that, the hybrid warfare strategy has been more successful as compared to direct military engagement. Therefore, it is expected that this trend would continue unless Pakistan overcomes its political, socio-economic and ethno-religious vulnerabilities. The study determines that India and Pakistan cannot win against each other in any direct or indirect military confrontation, however it is advisable that both states must overcome their differences, resolve outstanding issues through consistent dialogue process in an amicable way for long term peace and stability in South Asia.

---

### **Indian Hybrid warfare Strategy post 2008**

Pakistan and India are the common enemies in south Asia which have the most dangerous and coercive boundary and this harsh nature of neighborhoods is further going to complicate day by day through unresolved conflict i.e. Indian Occupied Kashmir, terrorism insurgencies at both sides, water issues, sir creek and most updated is the CPEC project.

Indian enrolment in Pakistan since 1947, exploiting these faults lines and are actively involved in subversive activities inside Pakistan in which we lost millions of civilian and military personals due to its conspiracies. These types of conflict are facing every single country in the modern 21<sup>st</sup> Century but with different perspectives and desires but it would not be catalyzed unless and until it could get external actor's supports. The same is the case of India with Pakistan. They constantly trying to create external actors and support aggravation to create division in Pakistan since 1968 after the establishment of RAW, but its hybrid strategy is getting more momentum after the Mumbai attack in 2008.

According to Retd. Brig. Rashid Bangash explaining the Indian HW strategy.

“India through adopting the concept of Hybrid war has replaced the traditional way of warfare and now uses cyber-technology, propaganda, fake news, and disinformation to exploit the internal fault lines of our country. In this type of war, society as a whole is vulnerable to the enemy's

maneuverings. It is quite evident from the news channels of India exploiting the Pakistani society through internal issues.”

### **3.2 Hybrid warfare strategy and its Execution by India**

Indian is not only the one state who are using HWS, since many countries retaining secret operation and irregular tactics to create hurdles for their enemies without actually involved in any kind of direct war. HW concept is not an old phenomenon for the globe but it presents always with different perspectives to the world. One of the Indian Realists Chanakya Kautilya, explaining the concept of UW in his six-fold policy in his traditional book Arthshastra. Kautilya advised in his book to the King for the using of secret agents, religions, and even women against their enemies to destroy it internally and order to get their national interest. He says that UW is a type of war in which a state can get their national interest without waging a direct war by assassinating the enemies. However, further advised to the king that in UW one cannot use weapons but it may use secret agents’ allies, vassal kings, even women and friends (Khattak M. R., 2020).

In an Interview with Dr. Riaz Kokar Assistant Director of Research CISS Islamabad through email, he is explaining the Indian Hybrid warfare rationale in the following Words.

“There is a multi-pronged rationale behind India’s hybrid warfare strategy against Pakistan. But some are following,

- a. To untangle the social cohesion in the society—to further disenfranchise people who feel being deprived of the state’s public goods (good education, health services, employment opportunities).
- b. To make it hard for Pakistan to gain diplomatic support for its global agendas (FATF is a case in point. Pakistan has nearly completed the FATF requirements but hasn’t yet been made off the grey list.) Pakistan has publicized a dossier enlisting a proven record of India’s involvement in terrorist incidents in Pakistan, but it is yet to be seen how much diplomatic support Pakistan gets on it.”

The Indian policy thinker launched rehabilitated and speedup their subversive operations against Pakistan after the Mumbai attack in 2008. Its main purpose was to restrains Pakistan’s support for the Kashmiri people. Pakistan and India have a long rebellious history but after the 2008 attack Indian policy got momentum and speedup their subversive activities inside Pakistan. Since 2004 the relationship between the neighbor’s countries was going towards bitterness and Vajpayee and

Musharraf hold a direct talk at the 12<sup>th</sup> summit of SAARC at Islamabad in 2004 and at the same year, their secretaries are also met. This year was marked with dialogues process and bilateral meetings was held between the government officials. Moreover, in November the newly elected Prime Minister of India Man Mohan Singh promises that he will reduce troops in Kashmir and they did what they promise by redeploys 5000, troops from Kashmir state but both countries did not reach an agreement to redeployed their troops from Siachen Glacier. In Addition, in 2007 the Samjuta Express is bombed near Panipat and almost sixty-eight people were killed and many of them were injured and relation once again is become a curse. But later in the month of September, the former Pakistan Prime Minister A. A Zardari, and the Prime Minister of India officially declared to open many trade ways due to which relations was going towards bitterness. Many of the Spies of the Indian army which was captured by the Pakistani army were Releasing and every year there will be a cricket series between two neighbor's states. Suddenly an abrupt change occurred, in Mumbai that a gunman is doing open firing on civilians from several sides on Nov 26, 2008. These terrorists enter through the marine side and first they hijack a board Kubon. They were ten persons and first they attack Rail terminal and killed 58 people, then they attacked Cama Hospital and Taj Mahal hotel where they killed 31 people and then Oberoi trident hotel. Sources say that almost 167 civilians were killed in this attack.

Most of these terrorist members were also killed and Ajmal Kasab was the only person who can captured alive and then found guilty of this attack and later sentenced to death. These are later founded by the members of Lashkar-e-Taiba. In response to this attack India breaks off talks with Pakistan and their foreign policy got the momentum to increase their HWS and blaming Pakistan for supporting the Khalistan movement in India (Minhas R. , 2019).

According to Retd. Brig. Rashid Bangash....

“The rationale for hybrid war is definitely to engage Pakistan in non-conventional warfare. As it is an undying fact that Pakistan's weapons manufacturing capability has become unbeaten. Therefore, there is need to use all other tactics including cyber-attacks, disinformation and other political, economic and non-political approaches in addition to traditional military tactics.”

### **3.3 The Application of Hybrid Warfare on Pakistan**

The applications of HW on Pakistan is started not only from the 2008 attack but was observed since 1947 with different perspectives and distrust. The new Delhi thinkers mostly believe that the government of Pakistan is always actively involved and playing a refusals role in IOK Indian occupied Kashmir and insurgencies of Sikh Khalistan, whereas Pakistan always accused Indians of supporting role in East Pakistan (later Bangladesh) Baluchistan areas and new emerging tribal areas of Fata. Pakistan always fronting multiple coercions by the Indian Hybrid strategy by supporting many groups inside Pakistan.

Our army Chief Gen. Bajwa addressing at Kakul about the Indian HWS, that our neighbor clearly knows that we cannot beat nuclear state with fair and square, but they will always be trying to weaken us internally by supporting different organizations and creating propaganda warfare and use of different military ways like CW, S. strikes but they will always fail as we see in recent years. Due to the nuclearization and the conventional response of Pakistan, the Indian cold start doctrine active military operations or surgical strikes lost their consequence. Further says that implementation of HW involves no risk for a nuclear program. As a result, we can say Indian forces and thinkers are mainly focused on HW application against Pakistan instead of any direct attack. In the view of Professor Zafar Nawaz Jaspal, “the nucleus of the hybrid war revolve around the fact that Indian always trying to manipulate all dimensions to undermines Pakistan Security (Ahsin, 218) (Novem, May, 2019).

According to Col. Brig. Rashid Bangash

“The rationale for hybrid war is definitely to engage Pakistan in non-conventional warfare. As it is an underlying fact that Pakistan’s weapons manufacturing capability has become unbeaten. Therefore, there is need to use all other tactics including cyber-attacks, disinformation and other political, economic and nonpolitical approaches in addition to traditional military tactics.”

The Indian HWS not an old concept but they are using it since 1968, with the establishment of the RAW agency. The group of Mukti Bahini M.B is one of the typical examples of the Successful application of the Indian Hybrid warfare strategy and the first terrorist organization which is also known as Bangladeshi forces, was created by RAW which played a crucial role during the Bangladesh war in 1971. Mukti Bahini and Kader Bahini were created, trained funded armed, and

provided logistic supports by the Indian intelligence agency RAW during the 1971 war, in a result, Pakistan faces a humiliating military defeat. The most prominent division of Mukti was Z forces which are led by Zia Ur-Rahman and the remaining K forces, S forces were led by different leaders (Kasturi, 1995).

According to Gen. Ret. Ehsan UL-Haq,

The element of hybrid warfare work in Pakistan for a very long time. And we saw these manifestations with the shape of East Pakistan in 1971, and they have to try to enhance its facets accordingly. All the things have been working against Pakistan whether it could be Psychological information, media culture, and military-diplomatic and it will have continued to be so ( (Khattak M. , 2019).

HW challenges is facing Pakistan since 1968 but it got momentum a few years later which are mostly facing the underdeveloped areas of Fata and Baluchistan. Such kind of tactics is using by India inside Pakistan to fuel the identity conflict in shape of fundamental right and stand up against the state. The best example is founded is the shape of Yadav which is captured in Baluchistan in provoking insurgencies and terrorism in whole Pakistan. Yadav was found guilty of subversive activities in Pakistan and considered an India Spy's. he was serving in the Indian naval forces but also, he was one of the RAW agents who was a captured in a search operation in the province of Baluchistan in 2016.

Pakistan foreign ministry tweeted that Commander Yadav is also serving operative in RAW, and later in 2017 they were sentenced to death by Federal Marshal court. But later India submits an appeal for Yadav at UNO in ICJ. ICJ rejected the appeal of India and ordered Pakistan to review the entire process of the case (Sham, 2019).

Hybrid threats today are a very serious concern for Pakistan's national security. Because of this Indian strategy, these unrest situations inside Pakistan are a series of threats for Pakistan security. This hybrid strategy gets series attention in many cases inside Pakistan e.g. a populated province i.e. Baluchistan which are one of the least developed provinces with a few numbers of road under the Chinese project CPEC which will connect western China through Pakistan with the Arabian Sea. But BLA group which are sponsored and backed by India clearly says that we will not tolerate any Chinese expansionist on Baloch soil. They were actively involved in the Karachi attack on the

Chinese Consulate in Nov, 2018. Where two Pakistani policemen and two civilians were martyred and no Chinese were killed. Sources say that BLA and their other separatist groups which are backed by India frequently target the Chinese Project of CPEC because the Indian spies injects fake propaganda in their minds that due to this project Chinese have captured the whole province and as a result Baluchistan will be no more in future.

The BLA group also issued three young person photos that were included in that Consulate attack in Karachi, they were Raziq Baloch, Raees Baloch, and Azal Khan, and later confined that they were being killed. As per Pakistan should need to raise their wings against this movement and clarify them how CPEC works for Baluchi People and especially for Pakistan, and also try to show the Interest of India who doing such propaganda by supporting these local people.

According to Shah M. Qureshi.....

There are some forces don't want peace in Pakistan and place always obstacles in the way of Pakistan. So, their progress and their obstacles were foiled by our young soldiers (Qurashee, 2019).

According to Zahid Hussain the Security Analyst explaining that.....

Pakistan should need to secure the CPEC project more because the latest attack is not having much effect on CPEC but it can be larger in the future.

There are two armed Baluch separatist groups BLA and BLF. Both are trying to fight for their independence with the name of the majority and ethnic Baluch nationalist movement with the active support of India. These groups were founded in 2000, and it led by Akbar Bugatti, who has been killed by military forces in a search operation in 2006. BLA and BLF groups carried out many bombs and suicide attacks and using guns against the civilian and military forces who were thought to destroy the demographic of their province, which was injected by Indian's propaganda in their minds. However, the BLA group has also targeted some pipeline infrastructure which clearly shows the Indian supporting side. Since 2014 Indian HWS is targeting Chinese people who are working on the CPEC project. Later these groups were listed as a terrorist groups who are supported by Indian agencies.

### **Technical service Division and Secret Units in the Indian Army**

Technical service division TSD was a secret covert operation squad to conduct operations against their enemies and neighbors' countries, especially Pakistan. It was found after the Mumbai attack in 2008 and the recommendation came from the Director of General Military Intelligence (DGMI) in May 2010 during the tenure of General Deepak Kapoor. On March 30, 2012, Gen VK Singh was retired and it was later handed over to Munishwar Nath (Singh S, 2015)

The Indian military's capacity to execute the Cold Start Doctrine (CSD) against Pakistan after the 26/11 Mumbai attacks provoked the Indian policy thinkers to service secret means to redress the Mumbai attacks. So, in response to that context, the former Indian Army chief, formed these secret units in the Indian army which is known as Technical Service Division (TSD). It could also be considered that TSD is working as a Planner and creating secret units in neighboring countries like Pakistan and its main purposes are to get the support of IOK people, target LET, and mostly leadership in Pakistan to carry out their non-stop terrorist activities and creating a subversive situations inside Pakistan (Ex-Indian army Chief admits sponsoring terrorism in Baluchistan).

TSD is trying to support eight operations in foreign countries and claimed that it has spent a few crores on those operations. It has accused to overthrow the Omar Abdullah government, and besides these reports prepared by the director-general military operations. Lt. General vined Bhatia has claimed that we spend almost 1.19 crore and was give it G. Hassan Mir, who is the minister of agriculture in Jammu and Kashmir to topple down the Omar Abdullah government. However, he also says that almost 2.38 Crore were given for an NGO on the name of Jammu and Kashmir Humanitarian Service Organization which are run by Hakikat Singh.

TSD also approved different operations but the most important one was Rehbar I\_II\_III which was launched for Kashmir, the second one was O.S.S. and the last but not the least one is O.D.S which was sponsored out inside Pakistan (Baweja, 2013). These three operations were highly secret and no details were found on open media because these Operations were handled by TSD (Probably against Pakistan) and the names which are given to these operations are states in India like (Operation Seven Sister of Northeast India) and this is the reason that no detailed is available on any website of social media nor any others documents available on it. These are also considered eight secret operations which was passed by TSD which are supported in enemies' states and paid money to them to carry out these subversive activities inside the enemies states and order to get their interest and we can say undoubtedly Pakistan is one of them (Singh, 2015).

Here we can say notable that Pakistan and India have been accusing each other of aggravating militancy groups in their corresponding countries. On the indication bases, we can suggest the Technical Service division unit frolicked its bloody role in making subversions in the province of Baluchistan. The recent capture of the Kulbushan Yadav was the main sign of Indian secret operations inside Pakistan. Moreover, it is also described that Kulbushan Yadav join TSD in 2012. So, on behalf of this evidence is also considered that it might be a part of TSD to create subversion in Pakistan (Thapar, 2017).

Our CJCS Gen. Zubair Mahmood Hayat, stated that the Indian Secret agency had established many cells in 2015 to sabotage China Pakistan Economic Corridor, However, the recent hand in these subversive activities is Research and Analysis Wing (RAW). Sources say that RAW has run \$500 Cell to Sabotage CPEC (Hayat, 2017).

The Yadav confessions stories mention that he was actively engaged in rebellious activities inside Pakistan with the support of their government especially in the province of Baluchistan and city of Karachi in which many Pakistani Civilian were martyred (Yadav, 2016). According to Yadav's confessions videos that he was given task with disruption of CPEC and Gwadar Port, uncertainty, and subversion in Pakistan (Yadav, 2016).

According to Gen. Retd. Naeem Lodhi.....

Naeem Lodhi Stated that The Capturing of Kalbushan Yadav and their other networks is a piece of evidence that India is actively pursuing the doctrine of Hybrid Warfare which got movement after the 2008 Mumbai Attack. Further says that it is not only that they wage war against us but they were doing these strategies from inceptions of Pakistan and now they will try to increase it and try to weaken us in every field whether it may be economic or social and the reason is clear that they are not in the interest of CPEC (Khattak M. , 2018) (Lodhi L. G., 2018).

So, it could be concluded someone easily that today Pakistan has witnessed these renewed terrorist attacks and many cities like Karachi and the province of Baluchistan.

Later the TSD squad leader General V.K Singh after the departure from his job he joined the BJP and won the election from Ghaziabad polling station with an enormous lead and become the member of the Parliament of the Lok Sabha for Uttar Pradesh in that year's general election (Singh A. , 2014). Which is an antagonistic individual with an Anti-Pakistan pretentiousness, in

the mandatory of BJP government would be troublesome for Pakistan. It could be suggested that when it comes to Pakistan strategic issues it is obvious, and its thinking against Pakistan is practical military operations and strikes (Khattak M. R., 2020).

### **Ajit Doval's Defensive-Offensive Doctrine (Blue Eyed Boy of Modi)**

Modi was appointed Ajit Doval as an NSA member which was another main concern to deal aggressively with insurgencies in the state of Kashmir and the province of Baluchistan and limit its supports from Pakistan. The selection of Blue-eyed is giving promotion to Hindu nationalism and making India a regional hegemon to promote Hindutva ideology. Ajit Doval was spent almost seven years in Pakistan to live with the local people of Pakistan and get information about Muslim society. He was very fluent in Urdu speaking and he can get much knowledge about Islam and Muslims. Therefore, he started living here he saw many weaknesses of Pakistani people and he has considered an unmatched security expert in Pakistan affairs which gives him the title of **Blue-Eyed Boy of Modi** (Syed, 2019).

According to Retd. Bangash explaining the Ajit Doval doctrine.

“I feel there is a great threat to Pakistan exist in this context. Air strikes on Pakistan in 2019/2020 which were resisted bravely by Pakistani Air Force leading to the Surrender of Abhi Nandan. Pakistan must be vigilant and make a counter doctrine to ensure that war is fought, if it to be, on the enemy territory.”

According to the Air Marshal M. Ashfaq...

The Indian military forces always try to achieve their interest with hidden operations and trying to weaken Pakistan internally (Arian, 2018).

Indian National Security advisor said that there are three different modes on which we can tackle our enemies. i. Defensive mode ii. Defensive-Offensive and iii. Offensive mode. In Defensive Mode, it shows from the name that securing your door at your soil. For example, what chowkidars and chaprassies do to prevent someone unknown without permission. While in the defensive-offensive mode you can try to remove the root of the treat and try to neutralize it. While the last offensive mode, you can come out strongly and rightly.

When it comes in the way of Pakistan, so they have the offensive option on their tables but they cannot use it against the nuclear state. So, it could be summarized that Indians forces are clearly emphasized on the last strategy which is defensive offense mode and its main purpose is to the exploiting of economic political and especially the security vulnerabilities of Pakistan (Syed, 2019). Ajit also addressing to NSA and give them an example of a defensive mood. He says we need to change our defensive mood because in this type of mood you threw 100 stones on me, I stopped 90 of them but still, the remaining 10 also hurt me. Which shows equilibrium. The main them of the Ajit Doval Doctrine which may come out to went viral that, you may do with one Mumbai, you may lose one Baluchistan. This shows that this time they are more devastating in Baluch areas and will be prescribed terrorist activities. Therefore we must need to arrange our counter-strategy keeping a view on the Indian approaches which never let you in peace (Syed, 2019).

The Chankya addressing the king in his book Arthshastra that never desires ethical pondering against the enemy when it comes to secret operations but rather believes and it done with practical calculations. He stated to with the king that if the people beleaguered or dissatisfied with the king own forces are very easy to entice, to divide among themselves, and then should make march or war (Boesche, 2002). This is the true appearance of hybrid warfare strategy, in which the Indian Government aims to sub verse Pakistan, socio-economically, politically, strategically, and traditional vulnerabilities (Khattak M. , 2017).

Another senior Authorized person from the BJP government, Manohar Parrikar the minister of defense in a conference that “we will deal with our neighbor pro-actively, and we will counter-terrorism through terrorists only. Like there is a famous proverb in Urdu and English also that, you will demolish a thorn with the help of a thorn. Besides Pakistan got a clean sweep due to the Director-General of the national Assembly in Pathankot terrorist attack inquiry in IOK. Primarily the Indian BJP Government blame Pakistan that, Pakistan is involved in this Pathankot assault, but Director-General NIA (DGNIA) Sharad Kumar of India present “we couldn’t find evidence against Pakistan Government in Pathankot attack, further saying that there is no indication to show that Pakistan government and their agencies are supporting these groups like Jaish-Muhammad etc. (Arunima, 2016). Though, the BJP government had already made up their mindset that these attacks were carries out by the Pakistani Army or ISI on IOK or Indian soil. But such approaches

are threatening for peace instability in the south Asian region. While the Indian spies and aggressive thinking have already taken place in Pakistan. So, to summarize, to desire peace between Pakistan and India in the presence of the BJP government, we can expect more subversive activities inside Pakistan especially in merged areas. Therefore, we always need to be alert for any kind of situation in the future, and what is more important for us is unity among us (Malik, 2020).

## **Indian Involvement in Afghanistan**

According to Dr. Riaz Kokar Assistant Director of Research CISS.

“India has been using Afghan soil for carrying out terrorist and insurgency operations in Pakistan. Pakistan has provided the international community with a dossier, documenting Indian intelligence agency (RAW’s) involvement in such destabilizing activities in Pakistan.”

The Indian government to a large extent trying to decrease the involvement of Pakistan in the foreign policy formation of Afghanistan, and trying to utilize an extremist regime against Pakistan. India has a major role in the proactive agenda of Afghanistan and has a greater role in the regional and foreign affair of Afghanistan against Pakistan. India always makes sure to make Afghanistan a universal donor to provide him necessary aid to Afghanistan and in response, they can use their soil against their enemies.

As we know that since the 9/11 attack Pakistan government has always confronted series of issues of belligerency and terrorist activities especially in tribal areas of Baluchistan, in which almost Pakistan lost billions of economic and civilians’ people and about 5498 military personals were martyred. In response, Pakistani forces were deployed around about 2 million forces in Fata (Gul, 2020) to restrain extremist activities across the border. The Ex-TTP commander and the other militants’ groups Latif Mehsud’s exposed the Indian activities who are later arrested in Afghanistan by United States forces and later handed over to Pakistan. Sources say that they were collecting funds and instructions in Afghanistan by RAW and Afghan authorities.

Another main confessionary statement by the former US defense secretary in a debate at the University of Cameron in Oklahoma in 2011 said that India is always using Afghan soil as a second front line against Pakistan. However, India has over the years financed problems for Pakistan on that side of the border and you can carry that into any dimension. Further explaining, India is

always used Afghanistan for its own purposes, and creating a problem for Pakistan from Afghanistan (Debate at University of Cameron) (Univerity, 2011).

The Ex-TTP spokesman Ehsan Ullah Ehsan was surrendered in 2017. In his confessions, he was exposed that Afghanistan soil is being used by TTP members and other militant organizations against Pakistan. However, Ehsan's claims were verified by Yadav in his interviews with Pakistan military forces that, India is creating hurdles for Pakistan from their embassies and using Afghan soil against Pakistan (Yousaf, 2017). Moreover, Defence Minister Khawaja Muhammad Asif, speaking at the National assembly, said "India was using Afghan soil for acts of terrorism in Pakistan to destabilize the country". Speaking on the floor of the National Assembly, stated that sitting in Afghanistan India has outsourced the task of terrorism in Pakistan. He further declared that Afghanistan in coordination with India is crosshatching intrigues against the security of Pakistan (Khan, 2017).

The Indian main concern is to engaged Pakistan in these subversive activities internally that it could not raise a hand for Kashmiri People. Moreover, the Indian policymakers are trying to isolate Pakistan internally and globally and keep engaged them within their internal sabotages and that could never come out for their diplomatic offensive.

In Arthshastra's book Kautilya advised the king for defeating an enemy a king must need to use offensive-defensive diplomacy to defeat the enemy. He says that diplomacy is an art of war or action on which you can weaken your enemy and order to get your interest (Langhorn, 2011).

In this way, this is what that India is always blaming Pakistan for terrorist attacks in IOK without any concrete evidence. Furthermore, India is boycotting the regional organization SAARC summit along with others states like Bhutan Bangladesh was also a part of their offensive-defensive mode to isolate Pakistan regionally and globally. Moreover, as Sushma Suraj clearly defines that we will isolate Pakistan regionally and globally and they did it (Sansanwal, 2016) (Bokhari, 2016).

According to Dr. Masood-Ur-Rehman Khattak India is achieving three main objectives through a Hybrid warfare strategy. First, they want to impose heavy economic losses on Pakistan. Secondly, they want to compel the Pakistan army to deploy major armed chunks on neighbor borders, the last one is HWS in which many casualties were occurred inside Pakistan instead of direct war. But due to God's blessing Pakistan always get success against TTP, Al Qaeda, and many other groups

by doing many search operations and the most achievable is the capturing of Kalbushan Yadav, which is a very big success for Pakistan. Moreover, security situations in Baluchistan and the city of Karachi have also been enhanced with a constant intelligence-based actions development project that is China Pakistan Economic Corridor, and the rehabilitation of Baloch insurgents (Khattak M. R., 2020). The modernization in Indian military forces creates a power maximization and security dilemma for Pakistan, and would be created a disparity in the region. While this thinking shows aggrieve mode which could fall the region into further disorder and disparity. In response to that Pakistan is also trying to modernized its technology, weapons, to fill this gap in conventional deterrence and keep equality with India in the South Asian region. But the Indian military suggests that due to doctrinal transformational there is little chance of limited war between neighboring countries. But as we see after the Nuclear capability of each neighbor states the possibility of open war has diminished but now this new phenomenon in the shape of hybrid strategy is using by the Indian military to carry out conventional warfare or caring out surgical strikes with special forces, advanced technology, and helicopters and highly sophisticated weapons and propaganda warfare (Khattak M. U.-R., 2018).

The current positions of the neighboring states will be led to a complete type of direct war in the future. But in response that Pakistan is not in an economic position to fight a direct war with India, but it will try to fill this gap for future security in long-range missile systems, air defense systems, S-400, etc. Due to God's blessing, Pakistan would ultimately rely on its nuclear capabilities to counter Indian military conventional capabilities. As for deterrence of India is concerned Pakistan has long and short-range missile system like TNWs, are considered by the many westerners as a source of Instability (Tellis, 2017).

According to Michael Krepon TNWs are very least safe and secure nuclear weapons which could be deployed near the battleground (Ku, 2011). But on the others side, Pakistan's concerns are totally different from the western and Indian perspective.

According to Pakistani military thinkers that TNWs are to deter the Indians military and stop it from internal aggression in Pakistan. If it could be developed it will certainly provide a high level of proof to these security assets.

Gen. Khalid Kidwai rationalized the development of TNWs in the following words. That our great concern could be neutralized the Indian Cold Start Doctrine and find an answer of to this doctrine

in the shape of TNWs. In Pakistan's context due to TNWs the era of war is over in Pakistan (Khattak M. , 2019).

The Dependency of Pakistan's military forces on nuclear technology would be a dangerous development in the Asian region. Which put a clear-cut deterrence at great risk. In response, if India is responded to Pakistan on their modernized tactical nuclear capabilities will create a miserable picture of deterrence in the south Asian region. This clearly shows that a small accident may lead to a full-fledged war in the future and the exchange of nuclear weapons. As result, we could say that any conflict in Asia will far-reaching impacts on regional and global security (Kakar, 2019).

### **India Undeclared War through Iran-(Chabahar)**

To understand the Yadav story, and the Indian Undeclared war strategy through Iran we will get help from the map of Chabahar which literally means "four seasons in Persia" which are considered that with the help of India Iran is developing a port that using Chabahar against Pakistan. Chabahar is a place where the political agent of RAW i.e. Yadav was operated. While the Indian blames that it was established by Pakistan forces itself and military forces Captured and arrested him for spying in Baluchistan.

Beyond Yadav, there are other many noteworthy Indian angels to the Chabahar story. Moreover, instead of Chabahar India is also keeps its eyes on the line of Zahedan which is inside Iran, and Iran is the only route to open it. The Sino-Pak never wants the Indian stakes holds in Chabahar because due to this strategy they are using undeclared war through Iran (Ahsen, 2019).

As we see Kalbushan Yadav was arrested in 2016, and a source says that in 2012, 13 Kulbushan was wished to join TSD, but it is well-known that Yadav is working for TSD. Which is also a part of the Indian Hybrid warfare strategy. The main reason behind this was that the maritime security of Pakistan where its position so it is deployed in Chabahar and it is captured in Baluchistan. So, the main reason behind this deployment of Kalbushan under maritime export warfare is to find out the inbound and outbound maritime traffic, like cargo, oil tanker, and to harm it and give the name that it was done by BLNA. For example, if there is a fast boat and it has 1000 kg explosive and hit it with the oil tanker so it is a running bomb, and their losses will be millions. Then no state will carry trade with Pakistan because of this Kulbushan our maritime security can be disrupted, If

Yadav become succeeded, but is God's blessing that he was captured in 2016. However, it doesn't mean that these things are finished it will increase more. Our CGSC General Zubair Hayat was delivering in a seminar that India has created a \$500 special cell for disrupting CPEC. CPEC is very biggest project and it will change the future of Pakistan and also become a symbol for China-Pakistan friendships. But India is doing anything for disrupting the China Pakistan friendship and it can happen anytime anywhere (Minhas D. A., 2019).

According to Riaz Kokar....

“Yadav **was** deployed to foment insurgency and fund terrorism on the mainland Pakistan. I doubt if he was sent to disturb the maritime security. He is now apprehended.

Pakistan faces threats in the maritime security from India in long-term, especially in the event of a war between the two countries. In the February 2019 episode, India deployed its nuclear submarine toward the Pakistani shores. Pakistani Navy identified it and warned the Indian submarine to return otherwise it will be attacked. The objective of an enemy submarine is always to remain under water and hidden from the enemy sight. If it is identified, it fails in its mission. Getting identified is tantamount to getting destroyed. If it was a hot war, Pakistan Navy would have destroyed it right away. But Pakistan did not want to escalate the war.”

## **Offensive Diplomacy**

“Diplomacy is an art. It is the art of telling someone to go to hell and convincing them to look forward to the trip” (Winston Churchill).

According to Retd. Left. Rashid Bangash explaining the Indian offensive diplomacy in following words.

“At the moment I Think India is highly successful in isolating Pakistan in the region and at the global level. There are many examples where Pakistan could not convince the international community for voting in favor of Pakistan. The present weak and low position of Pakistan in the OIC is the evidence of failure of Pakistani Leadership to address the issue. (Pakistan used to be the leader of Muslim world and now having no friend. while India on the other is a major partner of the Muslim world). International community has accepted the India's stand on Kashmir and constitutional amendments. Nobody is supporting Pakistan.”

Diplomacy is as old as cross-border human interaction all over the world. Modern diplomacy has certainly come a long way, and for the most part, it has involved improving economic and commercial relationships between nations. It is also important to notice that sometimes these offices are called ‘missions’; because the name suggests, a ‘mission’ has to have a transparent aim, direction, procedure, and execution of responsibilities. Diplomacy can take multiple forms in peacekeeping and geopolitics. There’s a large kind of diplomatic interactions and it could aspire for peace or pacifism, coercion (both economic and military), public and people’s communications, intermediary and Track II efforts, and also the rather rarely used trajectory of nuclear diplomacy. With technological advancement, diplomatic efforts using electronic and social media, both for offensive and defensive gesticulations, have gained popularity. Diplomacy as a desirably virtuous channel has been used increasingly for the fulfillment of a mission that is usually not in consonance with the moral norms and advantages of host nations or neighbors. For instance, India established almost 24 consulates in Afghanistan along the Pakistan border during the peak of the American invasion of Afghanistan (some claims put the figure near 50). The presence of such an outsized number of consulates features a ‘mission’ and is under no circumstance’s peaceful diplomacy. The aim has been to recruit rebellious Baloch youth and bribe them to conduct terrorist activities against Pakistan through the Modi-Duval doctrine and their Offensive defense diplomacy. A worrying question is why Pakistan cannot reciprocate in kind? Indians have crossed ethical borders (and regrettably the international border as well) and contravened against all norms of diplomatic culture. They’re openly defaming Pakistan’s image and trying their best to physically and economically damage its interests. Diplomatically, Pakistan might not be in an exceeding position for coercive diplomacy against India because of its smaller geography and socio-economic problems. Social media and technology have, however, made the task of smaller nations easier and provided a tier platform. Unitedly with regional neighbors like Nepal and the country, Pakistan can gain physical grounds in offensive diplomacy through the appliance of chaos theory and practicing it through social media. This is often how India reaps the fruits of the Modi-Duval doctrine in addition. The Western narrative which has been promoted by the Indian diaspora over the past few decades portrays Pakistan as a have-not with a state-of-the-art gun, who would either sell the weapon to form a living or kill someone to try and do the same. In this manner, it's also vital to notice Pakistan’s image as a responsible nuclear nation desiring peace within the region and globally. Also, what must be highlighted is that the Indian polity’s

foolish and baseless anti-Pakistan jingoism. The presence of 36 secessionist movements in India exceptionally contributes to destabilizing a sham democracy and, by inference, the whole region. However, the presence for pretty much twenty years of the known nuclear arsenal in Pakistan's inventory, and also the absence of any credible violation of international norms, safely place Pakistan alongside the other nuclear nation. After all, every nation preserving the technology has been guilty of sharing it with others including the 'original proliferator'. Beyond that Pakistan has a spotless record in safety, security, and safeguard of its nuclear resource, something that can't be claimed by India. In fact, but a year ago five Indians were caught trying to sell uranium in Kolkata openly. a rustic with such a shameful nuclear safety record is least suited to lecture others on the 'how to' of nuclear safety, security and safeguard. In another interesting case, America, one among the foremost technologically advanced nations, has its recent record tainted. In 2007 a B-52 pilot flew for three hours over multiple states within the USA, carrying six nuclear warheads. From the diplomatic point of view, India had attained three objectives from Pulwama spat: entangle Pakistan militarily and build a response dilemma; expose Pakistan as a state which supports terrorism (as if the globe has forgotten the Kalbushan Jadhav case) so as to distract global attention far away from the Kashmir issue; and, finally, strengthen India's regional status as a counterweight to China and game-spoiler for the CPEC. Fortunately, because of God's blessing, none of those objectives materialized. Pakistan responded adequately and effectively on the military front and, resultantly, the planet wasn't able to buy the remaining two Indian narratives. For the primary time after the Pulwama attack, Pakistan went on a diplomatic offensive. A factsheet was put out for the globe to investigate. As a result, many independent media houses confirmed the Pakistani side of the story, and also the entire Indian media together with their Modis and Duals had to bite their tongues. The era of pronounced duplicity has become the new normal after Trump's election as President. America openly sides with India, be it in signing a nuclear deal or in violating American economic sanctions against Iran. Now what has to be understood is that rather like India and also the U.S., Pakistan has its own national interests and desires and can do whatever is suitable for its economic and security needs, whether it's buying oil from Iran or strengthening the CPEC project with China. Using the BRI forum in China, PM Imran Khan needed to project an offensive diplomatic platform. The presence of virtually 37 heads of state, over 5,000 delegates from 122 countries and almost 50 international organizations, offered a big opportunity to market Pakistan's aspirations of peaceful coexistence within the region. Such peace could only be assured if the rights

of all minorities within the region is assured, including Muslims in Indian occupied Kashmir. Although India is unlikely to hitch the BRI forum, and China has reiterated having any grudge against India for not joining the method, ample rational arguments are made for India to hitch the BRI. Pakistan must resort to offensive diplomacy, or what could also be termed as hybrid diplomacy, embroiling India on social media and everyone other possible soft fronts (print and electronic), so the hypocrisy of the Indian democracy are often exposed internationally (Akram, 2018).

### **Impacts on Pakistan's Security**

In the contemporary world, every state has its own phenomena of state security system, as per their interest and security dilemma are concerned. Therefore, one cannot restrain any specific definition or concept of security that could retain or accept by all states within the current time.

There are some general elements that are usually founded within the protection of policy of almost all the countries within the globe. Which may include internal and external security, political, and economic security, border security, state and non-state terrorism and security protection. Among all the above elements of security concerns is different from state to states like, for example, US priority could also be combating terrorism, China's is also trying for hegemony, while India's is also trying for disintegration for other states etc. (Bukhari, 2011).

Coming to the security situations in Pakistan. So, from the inception of Pakistan in 1947 Pakistan is under the puzzles of Indian activities to create hurdles and weaken Pakistan internally.

The newly emerged Pakistan have many issues from the very initials from the British raj and Indian also i.e. water disputes, issue of Kashmir, LoC and border issues. The studies on Indo-Pak relations reveal competing conflicts and their roots causes are the suspicious thinking on each other from the very beginning. India has never accepted the existence of Pakistan and always trying to destabilized and threaten its survival (Bukhari, India-United States Strategic Partnership: Implications for Pakistan, 2011). Pakistan and India, always established unit postures for conventional warfare. India adopts the kautilya policies and mode 'offensive-defensive doctrine', which beliefs in the aggressive build-up and offensive action against the adversary just in case of attack (Bukhari, 2011). In response of Pakistani military establishment also adopts an offensive-defensive strategy with some addition to possessing sufficient reserves, surprise attacks, and

aggressive leadership; to fill the gap with the aggressor enemy one can establish reliable deterrence against any aggressor (Bukhari, 2011).

According to Retd. Left. Rashid Bangash explain the Impact of the HW on Pakistan in following words.

“India has been trying to disintegrate the different units of the federation of the Pakistan through its malign propagandas. Slogans like “MOODI KA JO YAR HAI GHADDAR HI” and labializing the political and non-political leaderships as traitors. A large segment of Pakistani society has been impressed with this false propaganda of the enemy. For Example, at the moment only one political party claims to be patriot and all other political parties, workers and leaders are friend of enemies and hence not trustworthy. The highest damage caused to Pakistani society trough mobilizing the workforce of only one party.”

### **Volatile Security System**

VSS is a statistical measure of the dispersion of returns for a given security or market index. In many cases, the higher will be volatility and the riskier security. Volatile Security is one of the print page lines for India to create internal and external problems for Pakistan because of the Ajit Doval Doctrine which is defensive-offensive. India is creating economic, political, and ethnic vulnerabilities for Pakistan. Moreover, exploiting the weaknesses of internal security of Pakistan and volatile it that Pakistan never protects himself in the future. So volatile security is one of the major concerns of Indian Hybrid warfare and a major threat to Pakistan security.

### **Financial Cost**

Another major threat to Pakistan in the shape of the financial cost. Since 9/11, situations in Pakistan are very worse and in nineteen years we lost almost 80,000 casualties and about 200 billion we loss directly and indirectly. Our (FDI) Foreign direct investment is finished and very hardly we succeeded in these terrorist activities. The amount which is lost in the following years is much effect on a state like Pakistan with the least developing state.

### **Civil-military Casualties**

The current scenarios show that Pakistan is at war. Or perhaps it would be not wrong to say that there are several interrelated armed conflicts underway in Pakistan after 9/11 with neighbor sate. A report is issued that how many people were killed and injured due to the conflict between India

and Pakistan. Since 2004 to 2006, 35,600 people were killed and almost 40,000 thousand were injured. Several other casualties have been wounded in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. However, from Jan to Aug about 400 were killed in drone attacks and from 2011 onward 500 people were killed in militant suicide attacks. Pakistan civilians were addressed to those who are fighting inside Pakistan is, that we blame Taliban and Army, and they are both responsible for it. The Taliban committed excesses when they challenged the right of the government then the government started their operation without differentiating between civilians and military which leads to many innocent people killings.

### **Threat to national Cohesion**

National Cohesion is the internal strength of a country to protect itself from any external threat and that strength comes only if a nation finds a common ground to unite in the face of both external and internal aggressors. Same as the story of Pakistan when it comes to national cohesion. India is strongly creating problems from the very initial and the country is also practiced solid times in the past. Now the current scenario is that India is still creating internal and external problems for Pakistan and create disharmony in Pakistan due to their Hybrid warfare. Presently India is used mount of pressure on Pakistan as she is indulging in chauvinism and war-mongering against Pakistan. Repeated violation of LoC (Line of Control), working boundary, and harassment to Pakistanis diplomatic staff in New Delhi seems to be part of a hybrid warfare plane. In national cohesion, Pakistan has a bit different story when it comes to national cohesion. Because India is openly creating problems for our national cohesion. This is time that we need to make efforts and together all social political-religious writer analysis and thinkers to make people realize the importance of national unity, national cohesion, which can strengthen us to stand against the foreboding actions of super-power (Iqbal, 2018).

### **Defaming Global Image/ Propaganda**

India is trying to create hurdles for Pakistan at every aspect of the field whether it is economic social or political and create propaganda against Pakistan i.e. Pakistan is a terrorist-supporting state. So, these are different tactics of Indian Hybrid warfare, inside there they have offensive diplomacy. As Sushmita Suraj, the Indian Foreign minister also clearly says that we will isolate Pakistan International and regionally and we see what they do in the shape of SAARC. So,

internationally they exploit Pakistan whether it is in the shape of FTTF or many other issues. So, this was a kind of offensive diplomacy is considered a part of hybrid warfare as many like media warfare or propaganda.

## **Regional Isolation/Threat**

Bilateral relation between Indo-Pak is always worse and below the tracker of misinterpretation, mistrust tension, and wars after the inception of both countries. The Indian government is determined to play a Hegemon role in the south Asian region but they're always a hurdle that comes out in the shape of Pakistan which is considered a big Challenge by the Indian policy-maker. To countering Pakistan India is using its bi-dimensional strategy towards Pakistan. First, it has strengthened its campaign to diplomatically regionally and globally isolate Pakistan at the international and regional level while another side they use, Hybrid strategy and use hard forced to faced terrorism and cross old lines. To achieve this strategy India is trying to use its multilayered approach to costume away Pakistan's position in the International Community and this is what they do in SAARC or in the shape of FTTF. There Ministers clearly announced that will isolate Pakistan in every aspect whether it social, political, or economic (AKram, 2019).

## **Conclusion**

HW is not an old thing but it comes from centuries like a strategy and comes out with different perspectives. I shall give you a small example of the Indian writer Chankya Kautilya, who's one of the Indian strategic old, and famous writers. The Indian military strategies have some role from Kautilya's policies. Kautilya wrote a book on the name of Arthshastra in which he defines the six-point policy for running a state. In which he mentions peace, war, diplomacy, utility, and double policy, etc. This six-fold policy the policy of war he further classified in three categories open war, in which we fight directly like our 1965 war, 1971, etc. Secondly, he mentions secret war, in this war people/enemies attack directly or we can say sudden attacks like the Indian cold start doctrine, or surgical strikes. Now if you can't fight these two wars and your enemy is also strong so you have the last strategy, that is undeclared war or Hybrid warfare.

Due to this strategy it can undermine you. Internationally you can also face problems and moreover, internal security challenges also created for you, so these all strategies come under Hybrid warfare. Now if we analyze this concept with modern time, and literature that is how it

defines people. So, we can take a good Example of Russia that how Russia control Crimea. Russia used a hybrid strategy against Crimea which is founded in modern literature and western literature also that how Russia attack or Ukraine, and control Crimea. To pressurized Ukraine Russia did direct attack, indirect attack, proxy war, propaganda war, cyber-attack so these all things comes together and Russia captured Crimea.

We know that India Pakistan are involve in this hybrid strategy for centuries against one another. Since 1947 till now we can do Cover operations against one another. So, it is not a new concept in our context but in 2008 when the Mumbai attack happened against India. So, from post-2008 the change which occurred in Indian hybrid strategy was phenomenal because before this such changes never happened. The change was that when the Mumbai attack happened in 2008, so India cannot attack Pakistan directly because Pakistan is also a nuclear power. India has a surgical strike option on his table but they also can't do that. When India cannot take such steps so they have the last strategy and what was that, that was the Hybrid warfare strategy. So, they launch an undeclared war strategy on Pakistan. So, what they did inside hybrid warfare, at that time the Indian army chief was general V.K sing and he made a secret units, inside the Indian army and because of that secret units they launch operation deep strike in Pakistan. The main purpose of operation deep strike was that to finished Hafiz Saeed and his circle. In addition, inside Pakistan, they blast bombs and many terrorist activities that weak Pakistan internally security and Pakistan didn't play any role in Afghanistan and Kashmir. So, post-2008 we see that GHQ attacks, Chinese consulate attacks, Chinese military insulations attacks, all ISI headquarter attack in addition they attack our security forces fared land. So many casualties happen in which we lose much. One of the examples of the Mehran airbase in which Indian connectivity's shows on behalf, that when a terrorist is entering into that airbase so they directly go to the PC3 Orein Airplane and they finished it. PC3 Orient airplane are used for maritime surveillance and they also detects submarine warships. There is no involvement of Taliban neither TTP but India at self-have some indirect role in this attack and because of TSD India did very bomb blast in Pakistan. It has a report of Omar Cheema on TSD and also Indian and western literature also existed and CBI also investigate TSD.

As we see Kalbushan Yadav was arrested in 2016, and sources says that in 2012, 13 Kulbushan was wished to join TSD, but it is well-known that Yadav is working for TSD. Which is also a part of the Indian Hybrid warfare strategy. The main reason behind this was that the maritime security

of Pakistan where its position so it is deployed in Chabahar and it is captured in Baluchistan. So, the main reason behind this deployment of Kalbushan under maritime export warfare is to find out the inbound and outbound maritime traffic, like cargo, oil tanker, and to harm it and give the name that it was done by BLNA. For example, if there is a fast boat and it has 1000 kg explosive and hit it with the oil tanker so it is a running bomb, and their losses will be millions. Then no state will carry trade with Pakistan because of this Kalbushan our maritime security can be disrupted, If Yadav become succeeded but is God's blessing that he was captured in 2016. However, it doesn't mean that these things are finished it will increase more. Our CGSC General Zubair Hayat was delivering in a seminar that India has created \$500 special cell for disrupting CPEC. CPEC is very biggest project and it will change the future of Pakistan and also become a symbol for China Pakistan friendships. But India is doing anything for disrupting the China Pakistan friendship and it can happen anytime anywhere.

Now another element of Hybrid warfare is looking in Afghanistan, and it is on the print page because of Ajit Doval's doctrine which is known as defensive Offence doctrine which means when you have a threat from somewhere so go there and eliminate it. So, they were thinking that India has a threat from Pakistan so why not they go there and challenge the economic vulnerabilities, political vulnerabilities, ethno-nation vulnerabilities and exploit it, moreover to exploit the weakness of internal security of Pakistan and volatile it that Pakistan never protects himself. As we see these things happen. Since 9/11 situation in Pakistan is very worse and in 19 years, we lose almost 80000 casualties, and about 200 billion we loss directly and indirectly. Our FDI is finished and with a very hard we succeeded in these terrorist activities.

India's hybrid warfare strategy is that TTP people which are here give him money and used it against Pakistan. Its prime example is Kalbushan Yadav who accept it in his interview. General Crystal also declared that India is using Afghanistan soil against Pakistan. Chuk Hagel American defense secretary says in 2013 that India is using financing for Pakistan from Afghanistan. Moreover, Ihsan Ullah Ihsan and Latif Masood who was TTP commander clearly show in their confessions video's that India is using Kabul soil in contrast to the state of Pakistan. So, it is the different tactics of the Indian Hybrid warfare strategy.

Inside there they have offensive diplomacy, as Sushmita Suraj, the Indian Foreign minister also clearly says that we will isolate Pakistan internationally and regionally and we see these things as

they boycott from SAARC. So, internationally they exploit Pakistan whether it is in the shape of FTTP or many other issues. So, this was one kind of offensive-diplomacy which is considered a part of a Hybrid war, as many like media warfare, psychological warfare as they did and will be doing. But in response, Pakistan is trying at a very peak level to counter this strategy. As arrest of Kalbushan is one of success for Pakistan. Different operations in Fata are also considered a positive response to counter India. To counter the Indian offensive diplomacy Pakistan, keep internationally good diplomacy, as we see South Asia, UAE and with the US in EU Pakistan get a special status. Moreover, our relationship was becoming good with China and slowly and gradually Pakistan gets a positive status at international level so it means our answers are educated to them and we will counter it in future.

All we need is national cohesion, unity and to improve our surveillance, electronic surveillance, and intelligence agencies. As to any means we can stop India and counter them.

As if we didn't learn from our mistakes in both India and Pakistan. But we can say Pakistan learn much because after 2004 Pakistan decreases its involvement in Kashmir and general Musharraf banned all organizations which a later attack Pakistan and we face losses. But in response, Pakistan clear cut declared that from now on we couldn't support the ordinary struggle of those organizations which are banned. But India didn't learn and still creating problems from Afghanistan and Baluchistan to disrupt Pakistan. It is needful for India that if they want peace in this region, they must accept that Pakistan is a nuclear power.

Today Pakistan is in that position that sources say, is the geographic pivot of the world, because Pakistan merged with three regions, central Asia, west Asia, and South Asia.

If we explain this geographic pivot so we can say that if India wants to keep good relations with Iran so it has to go through Pakistan, if it is with Afghanistan so it has to go through Pakistan. One of the best examples is that India wants to bring the iron reserve of Haji Ghak from Afghanistan inside Bamyan which is in the center of Afghanistan. So, from here they want these reserves through Chabahar and then to Mumbai so it becomes 3500 km distance but if they bring these reserves through Pakistan and Jalal Abad so it becomes 900km so benefits go to India. So, if they want positive negotiation with Pakistan so the situation will be normal if India didn't want so it may create a further problem for both states.

With an Interview Dr. Riaz Kokar Researcher CISS Islamabad explain that Pakistan is covering the Indian Strategy in following words.

“For the starters, thanks to the military operations of Pakistani army and intelligence gathering of the intelligence agencies, many terrorist attempts are preempted, and people allegedly getting India’s financial or moral support or being warned, reprehended, and dealt away with. Pakistan has created a great precedent for the world how to deal with terrorism and insurgency. And many countries do conduct joint exercises with the Pakistani Army to learn the tactics of counterterrorism and counter-insurgency operations.

Still, any foreign government’s involvement in creating social disharmony and carrying out terrorism and insurgency does put a lot of stress on the Pakistani security forces. Pakistan has been at the receiving end of targeted killings and terrorist incidents, especially from 2007 to 2015. And insurgency or ethno-political movements are still going on in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Baluchistan. This is indeed a challenge as the Pakistani security forces and intelligence agencies have to spend financial and human resources and time on local problems on a scale that could limit their attention to fighting enemies on the eastern and western front. Despite that, kudos to Pakistan Army and intelligence agencies that not only have they brought the United States to the negotiating table with the Taliban, but also have been successful in doing away with anti-Pakistan terrorists and insurgents living in hideouts in Afghanistan. In addition, Pakistan’s successful retaliation against India during the Balakot-Rajouri military clash in February 2019 is another evidence of Pakistan’s ability to deal with challenges on multiple fronts (Kokar, 2020).

## **Finding and Discussion**

The study revolves around three questions. The First question related to the concept of hybrid warfare and its applications tools? The second question focused on the rationale behind the Indian hybrid warfare post-2008 situations? The Third question focused on HWS and its impacts on Pakistan security? After the study of the literature on HW, my findings are not only focused on research objectives and questions but also further discussion on the topic and their main theme under discussion for their further researches and investigations.

### **i. The Strategic Thinking of India and Impacts of Kautilya’s Policies.**

The theoretical framework of the body that how Kautilya's policies influence Indian thinking. Chanakya Kautilya, who's one of the Indian strategic old, and famous writers. The Indian military strategies have some role from Kautilya's policies. Kautilya wrote a book on the name of AR shastra in which he defines the six-point policy for running a state. In which he mentions peace, war, diplomacy, utility, and double policy, etc. in this six-fold policy the policy of war he further classified in three categories open war, in which we fight directly like our 1965 war, 1971, etc. Secondly, he mentions secret war, in this war people/enemies attack directly or we can say sudden attacks like the Indian cold start doctrine, or surgical strikes. Now if you can't fight these two wars and your enemy is also strong so you have the last strategy that is undeclared war or Hybrid warfare. So Kautilya's policies have a strong influence over Indian strategic thinking.

However, it could be saying, the present government in India is influenced by Kautilya and their Indian army is using Kautilya Six-Fold policy against Pakistan.

The study also founded that the Indian forces are applying Kautilya policies of war on Pakistan and still trying to engaged Pakistan through Undeclared war. Through UW they are making internal security hurdles inside Pakistan to support militant organizations to create propaganda warfare against Pakistan. The study also finds out that due to HW Pakistan have very series of issue with militancy and security threat than direct military operations since inception.

## ii. **The strategy of hybrid warfare since 2008**

The research study concluded that Indian military forces have efficiently applied and supported their hybrid policies since 1947 and after the establishment of the RAW agency. But its practical momentum got very influence post-2008 Mumbai Attack. After the disappointment of CSD Indian strategic thinking came up with the Idea to destabilized Pakistan. Moreover, TSD unities carry out many secret units inside Pakistan to target LeT leadership and to deter the alleged support with Kashmiri people-based fighters. In response to that Pakistan, forces arrested many Indian spies who's effectively operationalized HWS inside Pakistan. We can take the best example for Kalbushan Yadav. The study also found that India is getting remarkable success in the field of IW due to creating instability in many regions of Pakistan which are still facing these problems of militancy. Pakistan was compelled to deploy its 2millions troops on afghan borders and because of the India, Pakistan lost millions of civilian and soldiers in the war against terror where somehow support of the RAW. As result, Pakistan has attained good control of militant groups inside

Pakistan, especially in the Baluchistan areas. But still, they are trying to disrupt the mega project of CPEC and regional connectivity. It also appears that it will be continued until both states come together and realized their proxies against each other's.

### iii. **Sub Conventional Warfare or Surgical Strikes**

The study finds that India is introduced its first surgical strike in 2012 and later in 2017 they also do the same sub-conventional warfare. It is also expected that India will do this in the future too. They are trying to carry out their surgical strikes with their Airforce but in response, Pakistan air force have also the capability to counter their S.C or S.S

As for as LoC is Crossing is concerned because of many reasons which are following.

- The Line of Control (LoC) is highly mobilized by both India and Pakistan.
- Pakistan Army has the capacity to capture their commando and helicopters which could be a source of embracement for India as it is done very recently Abi Nandan.
- Last but not the least India has only one option to carry out its surgical strikes but that was also failed very recently. The reason is they have lack adequate real-time information and human Intelligence.
- **Possibility of War in South Asian Region**

The study has focused on many un-structured Interviews of Retd. military officials who mostly argues that there is the possibility of limited or we can say Hybrid warfare in South Asia. Where Pakistani perspectives emphasize that due to Nuclear capability the field of hot war is over. And they believe that limited war from India will not consider limited for Pakistan but it may reach the hot war, which may lead to instability and turmoil. The research study also finds that any conflict if it is taking place from India or Pakistan whether it could be small or hot at the LoC and may not intensify further because of predictable equality vis-à-vis India.

### iv. **Ajit Doval's Defensive-Offensive Doctrine (Blue Eyed Boy of Modi)**

The Appointment of the Blue-Eyed man as NSA member by Modi is another step to deal aggressively insurgencies in Baluchistan and Kashmir and get its support from Pakistan-sponsored groups of India. PM Modi always finds to be obsessed with promoting Hindutva Ideology and aggressively support Hindu Nationalism. Doval was stationed here in a madrassa of Pakistan for

seven years as an agent with local people and order to get information about Islam and Muslims. He himself addressed that living there I learn many weaknesses of Pakistani people that's why he is considered an expert in Pakistan affairs, and later he was titled the **Blue-Eyed Boy of Modi**.

v. **India Undeclared War through Iran-(Chabahar).**

The study also finds to understand the Yadav story, and the Indian Undeclared war strategy through Iran from Chabahar. Chabahar literally means four Seasons of Persia. Chabahar is a place which used by India to enter Pakistan. Chabahar is that area where their former Spy Yadav was captured during search operations. Instead of embracement India is blaming Pakistan that they are kidnapped Yadav from Chabahar. India wants to sakes its hold in Chabahar and China and Pakistan did not want that Chabahar has come over the influence of India.

**vi. Pakistan can sustain War Race.**

Pakistan can sustain the race by improving its stature in the world. It must increase its friends so that there should be a constant moral pressure be kept on India.

I don't think both the countries would go for a big war. The small violations on LOC would be continued.

### **Recommendation**

In an interview with Prof. Dr. Tughral Yamin Associate Dean Centre for International Peace & Stability (CIPS) recommended that,

“what should be Pakistan's response to India's hybrid warfare. In my opinion the government needs to invest in the people. If the masses are happy and their wants are being fulfilled, they will not fall in the enemy's trap that everything is bad and that the country is headed towards chaos and collapse. in my opinion, If the people are convinced that the country is economically strong, they will close ranks and sustain all outside attempts to destabilize it”.

- Project India's terrorism and insurgency sponsoring activities in all the diplomatic forums (Pakistan has already been doing it).
- Pakistani diaspora needs to engage with politicians in the respective countries and highlight India's human rights violations against Muslims, not only in the mainland India, but also in the occupied Kashmir. They also need to insist on politicians in their respective countries to issue statements against India and pass resolutions against Indian atrocities in the occupied Kashmir.
- Pakistani authors need to write about India's human rights violations, terrorism and insurgency sponsorship in Pakistan and publish these articles in foreign renowned publication platforms.
- Pakistan also needs to address extremism (especially against minority communities) at home so that other countries do not point fingers at us for things that we say about India.
- Pakistan needs to enhance its economic muscle from a debt-serviced economy to a trade-driven economy.
- Pakistan also needs to diversify its diplomatic engagement to other countries in the region, such as Srilanka, Bangladesh, ASEAN countries, Japan, South Korea, and Australia.
- Not least, Pakistan must establish a good rapport with all of the P5+1 country to strengthen its diplomatic heft globally.
- Behavioral change based on tolerance is needed to be inculcated in all segments of society.
- Integration of the federating units must be ensured.
- All political, non-political and religious issues be resolved with maturity and respect to accept each other's viewpoint.
- Love for military and Armed forces must be inculcated through high level motivation and conduct of the Armed Forces Personnel.
- Labializing political, Military and religious leaders as traitor and Gadders must be done away with.
- Pakistan need to expand Defense Industry to fill the gap of operational fighting capabilities to meet the contemporary challenges and expand their defence System.
- Due to economic position of Pakistan it should need make strategic partnership with economic emerging state to sustain its economy. Taking the example of china which is new

economic emerging power and currently Sino-PK has joint manufacturing of JF thunder, aircrafts, and military exercises.

- We know that Pakistan cannot support costly weapons and technology arm race in the region especially with India, so resultantly the next option will be tactical nuclear weapons to maintain credible deterrence vis-vis India.
- In Research and technology ground Pakistan are very underdeveloped we also need to work on these highly technology areas and run with modern world with modern equipment's.
- The ultimate finding of this study is the consistent dialogue process between the neighbor states. Both states have the nuclear capability so it is impossible either to win one party or lose other one. The ultimate and suggested solutions is the table talk process. Both states are need to build of trust on each other and try to solve their issues with dialogue process.
- It can be started with low range disputes whether it could be Sir-Creek issue or Siachen which can be resolved in short period of time. We see because of many issues between the two neighbors' states relationships are not moving up, and both are taken position which may cause political or social implication for the two nation.

As if we didn't learn from our mistakes both India and Pakistan. But we can say Pakistan learn much because after 2004 Pakistan decreases their involvement in Kashmir and general Musharraf banned all organizations which are later attack on Pakistan and we face losses. But in response Pakistan clear cut declared that from now we couldn't support the ordinary struggle of that organizations which are banned. But India didn't learn and still creating problems from Afghanistan and Baluchistan to disrupt Pakistan. It is needful for India that if they want peace in this region, they must accept that Pakistan is a nuclear power.

## References

Ahsen, S. B. (2019). Hybrid Warfare In Paksitan---I. Daily Times, 13-21.

- Ahsin, S. (2018). Indian Hybrid Warfare. The News, 02-05.
- Akram, M. (2018). Hybrid Warfare. Dawn News, 12-19.
- AKram, M. (2019). Hybrid Warfare (Threats to Pakistan). Pakistan Security.
- Alexander, M. C. (2012). Hybrid Warfare. CPCD, 24-58.
- Alexander, M. C. (2018). What Do You Mean by, Hybrid Warfare? A content analysis on the Media coverage Of Hybrid Warfare Concept. Acadimeia.
- Arian. (2018). Ajit Doval Offensive Defensive Doctrine . The Hindustan times, 05-07.
- Arunima. (2016). No Evidence of Pakistan Govt Hand in Pathankot Attack DG NIA. CNN News, 02-06.
- Baweja. (2013). Indian Hybrid Warfare. The New York Times, 05.
- Boesche. (2002). Chankiya khatilya Policies . The Hindustan Times, 04.
- Bokhari. (2016). Regional Isolation . The Diplomat, 05-09.
- Bukhari, S. S. (2011). India-United States Strategic Partnership: Implications for Pakistan. Islamabad: Journal of Social Sciences.
- Bukhari, S. S. (2011). India-United States Strategic Partnership: Implications for Pakistan . Islamabad: Journal of Social Sciences .
- Cullen, D. P. (2016, 2017). Understanding of Hybrid Warfare. International Affairs.
- Cullen, E. R. (2016). What is Hybrid Warfare. Norwegian Institute of International affairs.
- Cullen, K. &. (2016). Hybrid Warfare and Its Implications . Washington: National Foundation .
- Cullen, K. &. (2016). What is Hybrid Warfare. NPI, 41-55.
- Dalton, T. (2017). Arm Race in South Asia . The New York times, 07-09.
- Gul, A. (2020). Pakistan claims Irrefutable evidence of Indian links to terrorism on Pakistani soil. Islamabad: South & Central Asia.
- Hayat, Z. (2017). Indian Subversive Activities. Islamabad: News Report.

- Hoffman, F. G. (2009). Hybrid Warfare and Challenges . JFQ Qattar , 34-39.
- Iqbal, S. (2018). Hybrid Warfare and its impact on Pakistan's Security . Creat space Independent .
- Kakar, F. (2019). Hybrid Warfare and Pakistan. Political Economy.
- Khan, A. (2017). Indian involment in Afghanistan . The Dawn News, 07-09.
- Khattak, M. (2017). Ajit Dovals Offesive Defensive Doctrine. Research Thesis, 34-37.
- Khattak, M. (2018). Indian Hybrid warafre Insurgencies . (G. R. Khalid, Interviewer)
- Khattak, M. (2019, May 01). Indian Hybrid warfare strategy . (G. R. Haq, Interviewer)
- Khattak, M. (2019). TNWs and its Importance. (K. kidwia, Interviewer)
- Khattak, M. R. (2020, June Satuarday). Indian Hybrid Warfare. (M. Afridy, Interviewer)
- Khattak, M. U.-R. (2018). The Evolution of New Indian Military Strategy; Implication for the Region. Research Gate, 7-9.
- Khurana, G. S. (2017). Maritime Dimension of Hybrid Warfare/ in the Indian Context . India: National Maritime Foundation.
- Kokar, R. (2020). Indian Hybrid Warfare. (Self, Interviewer)
- Korybko, A. (2017). Applicability of Hybrid Warfare to Pakistan; Challenges and Possible Responses. National Defence University.
- Ku, K. (2011). Nuclears Weaposn and Doctrines. Newyork: NPI.
- Langhorn, K. h. (2011). Kautilays Policies and Advices to king. CNN News, 07-09.
- Lodhi, L. G. (2018). Hybrid War and its Impact on Pakistan Society. CPSD Monograph.
- Lodhi, N. K. (2018). Hybrid war and Its Impacts on Pakistan Society . CPSD, 23-29.
- Malik, H. B. (2020). Justifying a Pakistani Response to India's warfare Campaign. South Asia.
- Minhas, D. A. (2019). Deterrence, Hybrid Warfare and pakistan. The Express.
- Minhas, R. (2019). Hybrid Warfare and Pakistan's Security. Al Jazeera, 3-8.

- NATO. (2012). Hybrid Warfare Phenomena. Newyork: NATO website.
- Novem, M. O. (May, 2019). The Hybrid Warfare on Hybrid War In Pakistan. Discussion in Strategic & foreign Affairs.
- Parrikar, M. (2020). Hybrid Warfare Challenges for Pakistan. Defence journal.
- patric, D. (n.d.).
- Puyvelde, D. V. (2015). Hybrid war – does it even exist? Nato Review Magazine.
- Qurashee, S. M. (2019). (A. Jazeera, Interviewer)
- Sadik, G. (2017). Europe's Hybrid Threats. In G. Sadik, Hybrid Warfare (p. 135). United Kingdom: Cambridge Scholars Publishing .
- Sansanwal. (2016). Indian Involment in Afghanistan.
- Sehgal, I. (October, 2018). Hybrid warfare Challenges For Pakistan. Daily Times.
- Sham, S. B. (2019). Hybrid Warfare and its challenges. Gulf News, 4-9.
- SI(M), B. B. (2019). Hybrid War and Challenges for Pakistan. Global Village Space.
- Singh. (2015). Hybrid warfare and its Implication. The Indian News, 06.
- Singh, A. (2014). Technical Service Division and VK Sing. Indian News, 05.
- Syed, A. R. (2019). Doval Doctrine and Covert Operations. Daily Times, 5-11.
- Tellis, A. (2017). Indian Military Modrinition and pakistan.
- Thapar. (2017). Indian Hybrid Warfare. Dawn News, 05.
- Univerity, C. (2011). Indain Involment in Afghnistan . Cameron University .
- Yadav, K. (2016). Investigation . (P. M. Court, Interviewer)
- Yousaf, K. (2017). Indian Using Afghan Soil against Pakistan . South & Central Asia, 06-09.